

# Guidelines for the Operation of the Tenure and Promotion Advisory Committee (TPAC) of Emory University

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
PART I. RESPONSIBILITIES, COMPOSITION, AND ELECTION OF TPAC	1
General Responsibilities	1
Membership	1
Terms of Members	2
Election Process for Eligible Faculty	2
TPAC Officers	3
PART II. TPAC OPERATIONS	3
Meeting Dates and Setting TPAC Agendas	3
Conflicts of Interest and Recusal from Review	3
Primary and Secondary Reviewers	4
Evidence Considered by TPAC	4
Content of Deliberations	4
Advisory Vote and Letter of the Deliberation	4
III. OTHER GUIDING PRINCIPLES	5
Note on Confidentiality	5
Note on Transparency	5

## INTRODUCTION

The Emory University Faculty Council approved the formation of the **Tenure and Promotion Advisory Committee (TPAC)** on April 14, 2015. TPAC is established to conduct a university-wide evaluation of all candidates who are nominated for: appointment or promotion to Associate Professor or Professor with tenure; promotion to professor currently holding tenure; or grant of tenure at rank, from all departments, if applicable, and from all schools and colleges at Emory University. Faculty will not be considered by TPAC without first being recommended by their respective school or college and Dean. TPAC will function according to these **Guidelines for the Operation of TPAC**, which are informed by the Statement of Principles for University Governance of the University Faculty Council. TPAC ensures a fair, consistent, timely, and transparent evaluation of all nominations. Respecting school/college and disciplinary distinctiveness, TPAC also assesses the qualifications of each candidate to advise the Provost and President on the appointment of faculty of outstanding quality and distinction, thereby promoting eminence across Emory University. The TPAC serves in an advisory capacity to the Provost and President, who determine whether the candidate should be recommended to the Emory Board of Trustees for appointment or promotion with tenure. The TPAC is administered by a staff person designated by the Provost.

In addition to these **Guidelines for TPAC**, each school or college has tenure and promotion guidelines, procedures, and policies specific to its faculty that are included in the dossiers submitted for TPAC's review. TPAC members are expected to know those guidelines and policies, and all faculty are advised to consult their respective school or college websites for those guidelines and policies.

Part I of this document describes the responsibilities, composition, and process for electing TPAC members. Part II sets forth the procedures that guide the work of TPAC. Part III provides final guiding principles for TPAC reviews.

## PART I. RESPONSIBILITIES, COMPOSITION, AND ELECTION OF TPAC

### General Responsibilities

The TPAC has the following general responsibilities:

1. To review nominations for tenure and/or promotion, including recruitments from outside of Emory University
2. To review the dossiers of candidates for merit and adherence to standard procedures for tenure and/or promotion reviews
3. To solicit additional information or clarification, if deemed necessary by a majority of voting members, from school/college Deans or their appointee
4. To make recommendations based on its deliberations and provide an advisory vote on the outcome which is submitted to the Provost and President
5. To review TPAC guidelines annually, and to revise them as needed, for review and approval, following the process for major revisions to the Emory Faculty Handbook
6. To provide a general report of its activities on an annual basis to the University Faculty Council

### Membership

In keeping with the Principles of University Governance, cited above, the TPAC includes *ex officio* members from the senior administration and elected members from the senior faculty. The inclusion of *ex officio* members respects the interdependence of university governance with regard to tenure and/or promotion and ensures transparency and good communication between the senior administration and the faculty. The election of faculty to TPAC reflects democratic faculty governance in university-level promotion and tenure reviews.

**Ex Officio Members.** TPAC will include three appointed and non-voting *ex officio* members, including the President, the Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs, and a staff member designated by the Provost.

**Elected Members.** TPAC will include eight elected members, one each from the schools of Business, Law, Nursing, Public Health, Theology, Medicine, Oxford College and Emory College. These TPAC members will be elected by the eligible voters in their respective school or college. The TPAC also will include four at-large members elected by all eligible voters across the university. These twelve members of TPAC will be voting members.

**Eligibility for Membership.** Persons serving on TPAC will hold the rank of Professor with tenure. In addition, they will have had significant experience in evaluating candidates for tenure and/or promotion. This experience would ordinarily be evidenced by service on school-level committees that review files of candidates. Current chairs of departments or areas, division directors, deans of schools or colleges, associate deans of faculty in schools or colleges, and any member of a school- or college-level tenure and promotion committee are ineligible to serve concurrently on their school or unit tenure and promotion committee and TPAC.

### **Terms of Members**

**Ex Officio Members.** An *ex officio* members of TPAC will hold membership so long as they occupy the administrative positions that entitle membership.

**Elected Members.** The term for an elected member will be three years, with one third of the membership elected in each year. A member will be eligible to serve a second consecutive term, but may not be re-elected for a third term until that person has not been a member for a period of at least two years. Terms will commence on August 1 of any given year and expire on July 31. Elected members who leave the University or who become ineligible to serve on TPAC will be replaced by an interim elections. The incoming elected members will serve for the duration of the remaining terms. If the unexpired terms are a single year, the incoming elected members will serve an additional full three year term after completing the final year of the previous term. At that point, they may be re-elected for a second full three-year term.

### **Election Process for Eligible Faculty**

**School-/College-Specific Nominations.** For open school/college positions on TPAC, the dean of that school or college will consult with the school's appointment, tenure, and promotion committee (in schools that have one) and will nominate faculty who are eligible for membership on TPAC. The dean will submit to the Office of the Provost the names of two qualified persons who are willing to serve in the open TPAC position and will provide all information needed to prepare the ballot.

**At-Large Nominations.** For open at-large positions, the Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs will solicit nominations directly from the tenured faculty. In consultation with TPAC, the Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs will develop a slate of all eligible candidates that takes into account the current composition of TPAC and ensures a continual balance across schools/colleges and discipline. Specifically, the four at-large positions will be distributed across broad areas of cross-cutting expertise, as follows: one in the STEM and health sciences, one in the social and behavioral sciences, one in the arts and humanities, and one unspecified at-large member. The ballot with the final slate of candidates will be sent to the Office of the Provost.

**Ballot.** The ballot for each school/college will contain the names of each person nominated for any open school/college position on TPAC and any open at-large position(s) on TPAC, with a brief biographical statement that describes the nominee's academic expertise and his or her experience evaluating candidates for tenure and/or promotion.

**Eligible Voters.** All tenured members of the faculty will be eligible to vote for an open position in his or her school or college and any open at-large position.

**Manner of Voting.** For all open positions on TPAC, the Office of Institutional Research (OIR) will administer the election electronically via a secured website. The voting site will be open seven days from the time OIR has sent all email invitations to eligible voters. Once the deadline for voting passes or OIR has received all votes, whichever is sooner, the results will be tabulated and certified by OIR and communicated to the Provost and the Chair of TPAC.

**Report of Voting.** The Office of the Provost will report the results of TPAC elections to the school/college deans who will inform the candidates.

### **TPAC Officers**

**Chair and Vice Chair.** TPAC will have two officer positions, a Chair and a Vice Chair, elected from its voting membership. The Chair or, in the Chair's absence, the Vice Chair, will direct committee activities in communication with the Office of the Provost. The Vice Chair will draft the letters summarizing the deliberations of candidates by TPAC. The Chair or, in the Chair's absence, the Vice Chair, will communicate the committee's recommendations to the Provost and President. Both officer positions are normally held for one-year terms. If possible, the Chair and Vice Chair in any given year will not come from the same school or college.

**Election of Officers.** At the second meeting of the fall semester, the voting members of TPAC will elect the Vice Chair from among the voting members who are not in their final year of service. The Vice Chair will succeed the Chair in the following year, at which time a new Vice Chair will be elected. If the Vice Chair is unable to serve as Chair, the voting members will directly elect a Chair and a Vice Chair. If the Chair is unable to complete the term, the Chair will be replaced by the Vice Chair, who will hold office for the unexpired term of the resigned Chair and for the year that the Vice Chair would in the normal course of events be the Chair. To replace a Vice Chair who has resigned or who has assumed the office of a resigned Chair, the Committee will elect a replacement from among its voting members. The elected person will hold the office of Vice Chair for the unexpired term of the Vice Chair who is being replaced, and that of Chair for the following year.

## **PART II. TPAC OPERATIONS**

### **Meeting Dates and Setting TPAC Agendas**

TPAC will typically meet monthly during the academic year (September to May). However, the committee's meeting schedule is determined by the Academic Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees meeting dates and the number of dossiers submitted for review by the schools. A staff member designated by the Provost will review all dossiers submitted to the Office of the Provost for adherence to the Provost's Checklist (See **Evidence Considered by TPAC**, below). A dossier will be placed on TPAC's agenda once a complete set of materials is received from the school or college. TPAC will review complete dossiers in the order of receipt unless acceleration is needed for the purposes of recruitment or retention. The members of TPAC request two weeks to review a completed dossier before discussing the nomination. Therefore, it is in the interest of the nominating dean to send the candidate's dossier to the Office of the Provost as early as possible. In unusual circumstances, significant updates to the dossier may be added before the meeting at which TPAC evaluates the nomination.

### **Conflicts of Interest and Recusal from Review**

Members of TPAC will disclose any relationship with the candidate that might be perceived by a reasonable observer to constitute a conflict of interest or source of bias with respect to the candidate. Members of TPAC will recuse themselves from a review if they have jointly published, held patents, held grants, or had other financial partnerships with the candidate within the last five years. TPAC members must also disclose when they served as mentors to or had other close personal relationships with the candidate (i.e., family member, spouse, partner, etc.), or believe they cannot be unbiased in voting on the recommendation for other reasons. When a conflict of interest arises, the TPAC member with the conflict will not be present during TPAC's discussion of the nomination

and will not vote on the nomination. Identified recusals will be noted in TPAC's letter to the President/Provost after the deliberation of each nomination.

### **Primary and Secondary Reviewers**

Each dossier will be assigned a primary and a secondary reviewer, who will be selected from among the non-recused, elected members of TPAC. Ideally the primary reviewer will be selected from a school other than that of the candidate. The Chair of TPAC will decide the dossier assignments and communicate them to the designated staff person in the Office of the Provost who will notate them on the meeting agenda. If the Chair is from the same school or college as the candidate, the Vice Chair will decide the final reviewer assignments. Care will be taken to ensure that the reviewers have a suitable breadth of knowledge to present the case to TPAC.

During TPAC's evaluation of a nomination, the primary reviewer will provide a brief presentation of the dossier. The secondary reviewer will present any supplemental information from the dossier relevant to the deliberation. All non-recused members of TPAC will participate in the discussion. The Vice Chair will take brief notes of each dossier presentation to be read aloud at the end of the discussions and before the TPAC vote.

### **Evidence Considered by TPAC**

In evaluating a candidate, TPAC relies on the candidate's dossier, which includes statements prepared by the candidate, nominating department (if applicable), nominating school or college, other supporting documents, and letters of evaluation solicited from recognized scholars in the candidate's discipline(s). The **Provost's Checklist** for candidates' files for promotion and tenure describes the content of the dossier: (<http://provost.emory.edu/documents/faculty/Provost-Tenure-Promotion-Checklist.pdf>). The dean for each school or college is responsible to review all dossiers for completeness and accuracy before submitting them to the Office of the Provost.

When deemed necessary by a majority of voting members, TPAC may solicit additional information or clarification from the dean of the candidate's school or college. The dean, or dean's appointee, should be available for possible consultation while TPAC is deliberating the candidate's dossier. The candidate will not be involved in this process.

### **Content of TPAC Deliberations**

TPAC will review all dossiers for adherence to standard procedures for tenure and/or promotion reviews. If any procedural questions about the dossier arise at this stage, the Chair may table the review, and the Provost will remit these questions to the candidate's dean for clarification.

In evaluating a nomination, the members of TPAC will be expected to know the guidelines for tenure and/or promotion of the school or college submitting the nomination, which are included in the dossier. TPAC's evaluation of the nomination will also be guided by the academic standards described in Section 3 (e) of the *Gray Book*, respecting variation across disciplines in how these standards are operationalized:

*Standards for appointments at rank, along with promotion and tenure, reflect the expectations that a faculty holds of its members. Each academic unit will set forth specific rules and guidelines for attaining a continuous appointment or promotion. Candidates for appointment or promotion to Associate Professor must show academic excellence, including meritorious scholarship, creative inquiry, and outstanding teaching, as well as have the demonstrated promise to become leaders and transform their field as their career progresses. Candidates for appointment or promotion to Professor must show scholarly excellence and be established, nationally or internationally, as among the most distinctive and recognized voices in their disciplines, consistently examining and addressing their fields' most pressing questions.*

### **Advisory Vote and Letter of the Deliberation**

A quorum of seven elected, non-recused members is required to deliberate a case and to call a vote. If a quorum is

not reached, both the deliberation and the vote will be postponed to a subsequent meeting. Members must be present to vote. The Vice Chair will read aloud the brief notes of the deliberation of each dossier, which will be amended as needed to satisfy the committee members before moving on to the next file. At the end of the deliberation, *ex officio* members will leave the room, and eligible TPAC members will vote by a show of hands whether to recommend the case for tenure and/or promotion. Immediately after the tally of the vote, TPAC will discuss and agree on the Vice Chair's letter of the deliberation. TPAC's vote and letter are advisory to the President and Provost, who determine whether the candidate should be recommended to the Emory Board of Trustees for appointment or promotion with grant of tenure., promotion currently holding tenure or grant of tenure within rank. TPAC's vote and letter will be included in the dossiers that proceed to the Board of Trustees.

### III. OTHER GUIDING PRINCIPLES

#### **Note on Confidentiality**

All aspects of TPAC's proceedings, other than its membership and these guidelines, are conducted with strict confidentiality. The date(s) when TPAC evaluates a nomination are made known only to individuals who need to participate in its deliberations. Similarly, the content of TPAC's discussion about a nomination and the actual advisory vote are restricted to the members of TPAC and to the President and Provost or their representatives. Committee members and any others who are involved with the TPAC review process in any way are expected to maintain confidentiality at all times.

#### **Note on Transparency**

It is in the best interests of the candidate, the departments (if applicable), the schools and colleges, and the University for TPAC's review process to be as open and transparent as possible, consistent with the privacy of the individuals involved and the confidentiality of the internal and external evaluations. Therefore, these guidelines will be publicly posted. Subject to the limits imposed by the requirement of confidentiality, candidates are strongly encouraged to seek advice from their dean and department chair on how reviews for tenure and/or promotion, in general, are conducted.

Presented to the University Faculty Council April 12, 2016

Approved by the President's Cabinet on May 3, 2016

Presented to the Academic Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees June 2, 2016

#### **TPAC Drafting Committee**

##### **Co-Chairs:**

Kathryn Yount, Emory College of Arts and Sciences, Rollins School of Public Health

Deborah Bruner, Nell Hodgson Woodruff School of Nursing

##### **Members:**

Henry Bayerle, Oxford College

Robyn Fivush, Emory College of Arts and Sciences, Office of the Provost

Ellen Idler, Emory College of Arts and Sciences

Narasimhan Jegadeesh, Goizueta Business School

Charles Shanor, School of Law

Thomas Wichmann, School of Medicine

Walter Wilson, Candler School of Theology

Lynn Zimmerman, Office of the Provost (ex officio)

##### **Visitors:**

T.L. Thomas, Goizueta Business School

#### **TPAC Implementation Committee:**

Deborah Watkins Bruner - Chair  
Henry Bayerle  
Pamela Scully  
Lynn Zimmerman